

**REPORT OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMITTEE ON RESULTS OF
ASSESSMENT OF COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS FOR
INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION OF ORGANISATIONS FOR
CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT (CPD) FOR HEALTHCARE
PROFESSIONALS**

"INTERNATIONAL CENTRE FOR MEDICAL EDUCATION «YES !!!»

Dates of the external visit - April 29-30, 2019

1. Composition of External Expert Committee

In accordance with the order of the ECA No. 31 dated April 11, 2019 formed External Expert Commission (EEC) for conducting institutional accreditation PE "International Centre for Medical Education «Yes !!!" on April 29-30, 2019, as follows:



Chairman - Foreign expert

Vladimir Davydovitch Wagner

Honored Doctor of the Russian Federation, the doctor of medical sciences, professor, head of department of the organization of dental services, licensing and accreditation of Federal State Institution " Central Research Institute of Dental and Maxillofacial Surgery" Ministry of Health, Moscow, Russian Federation

Tel .: +7 (903) 597 6027 e-mail: vagnerstar@yandex.ru



National academic expert

Khadzhieva Ayman Berikkalieвна

Candidate of Economic Sciences, Associate Professor
NAO "National Medical University named after S.D.
Asfendiyarov "

School "Public Health"

Department of "Integrated System of Health Economics
and Management"

tel .: + 7 777 014 5348.

e-mail: akhadjyeva@gmail.com



Expert - listener

Spankulova Samal Manarbekovna
Director of the dental clinic B & S_dentistry
tel .: + 7 701 244 1046



ECAQA observer

Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna
Head of accreditation and monitoring NU "Eurasian
Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in
Higher Education and Health care"
Tel .: +7 774 756 09212, info@ecaqa.org

In the period from 29.04.2019 till 30.04.2019 was carried out conformity assessment of PE "International Centre for Medical Education "Yes !!! " for compliance with the Standards for Institutional Accreditation of Organisations for Continuing Professional Development (CPD) for healthcare professionals of the ECAQA.

The EEC report contains an assessment of PE "International Centre for Medical Education "Yes !!! " on conformity to the Standards for Institutional Accreditation of Organisations for Continuing Professional Development (CPD) for healthcare professionals, EEC recommendations to further improve the organization of additional education.

2. General part of the final report of the EEC

2.1 Presentation of "International Centre for Medical Education "Yes !!! "

PE "International Centre for Medical Education "Yes !!!" (hereinafter - the Center) as the organization of additional education recorded October 17, 2018 in accordance with the CARD No. KZ59TWQ00546161. The idea of creating the Center belongs to the RPO United Kazakhstan Association of Dentist (EKAS<http://ekac.kz/>), In existence

since 2014 and previously carried out the training of national and international events and conferences. Until 2018 EKAS president is Professor Esembaeva S.S., who founded the PE "International Centre for Medical Education "Yes !!!" to continue the educational activities in the field of dentistry. In this regard, the establishment of the "Center" is unique and has a more than 4-year history of the training of dentists, forming groups of talented young dentists from the students and interns of medical schools for ulusheniya health of the population. Currently, the activity of the "Center" can be defined as the provision of continuing professional development and protection of the rights of health workers.

The main activity of the "Center" is to carry out the cycles of continuing medical education in the field of dental work.

The peculiarity of the organization in the "center" of cycles of advanced training and retraining of health workers determined that the results of the workshops form the content of educational programs, ie training is performed with lighting current problems in dentistry, such as dental implantology, orthodontics, periodontology, endodontics and others.

The content of continuing professional education in the "Center" covers all structural components of human capital (training, self-learning, personality, willingness to change, health and value human targets).

The main purpose of the plan of development of education programs "Center" is to improve the conditions for full-fledged, high quality supplementary professional education in accordance with the mission, vision, values and strategic objectives, aimed at creating an effective model of competitive specialist, representing the market high-quality dental care medical services, successfully to introduce modern technology in line with the increasing needs of the global community based on the principles of good, humanism and justice. For this purpose, the "Center" deals with the involvement of teachers from experienced dental practitioners of Kazakhstan and foreign speakers providing copyright training programs.

The spectrum of the "Center" audience includes both students of medical universities who wish in their free time ulushit zanniya and skills on specific topics to experienced dental practitioners and other physicians.

To solve the above problems the following tasks were defined:

1.To attract employers in the process of improving educational programs, the definition of professional competencies, training and methodological support of educational disciplines of a specialty offered by the employer, allowing students to obtain high-quality professional education, including Graduate Certificate or Certificate of standard pattern in the learning process.

2.To establish strong relations with structures to ensure and improve dental health, foreign partners in order to implement joint educational programs, attracting renowned scholars to the implementation of educational programs.

3.Attracting to conduct short courses, lectures, workshops, seminars, master classes, training of specialists - practitioners in the field of continuing medical education and dental activities (managers and doctors of dental clinics);

4.To expand range of educational services.

2.2 Information about previous accreditation

National institutional accreditation PE "International Centre for Medical Education "Yes !!! " has not been evaluated to date.

2.3 Analysis of the self-assessment report on the PE "International Centre for Medical Education "Yes !!! " for compliance with the Standards for Institutional Accreditation of Organisations for Continuing Professional Development (CPD) for healthcare professionals

Report on the institutional self-assessment of PE "International Centre for Medical Education "Yes !!! " is presented on 109 pages, excluding annexes, characterized by completeness, structuring of information and internal unity. A cover letter signed by the Director of the "Center" Esembaeva S.S. is attached to the report, confirming the authenticity of the information and data contained in the report.

The report was prepared in accordance with the Guidelines for self-assessment in the framework of institutional accreditation and the relevant standards of institutional accreditation of additional education organizations (CPD) ECA. There is a list of members of the internal committee self-assessment indicating the responsibility of each member of the internal commission (total 4 people), information about the representatives of the "Center", responsible for the conduct of institutional self - Zimbaeva Nargiz Maratovna, deputy director, commercial director, executive in charge, as well as about chairman of the internal Commission for the preparation for institutional accreditation - Esembaeva Saule Serikovna.

The self-assessment of the "Center" was carried out on the basis of the Agreement on Institutional Accreditation No. 9 of January 9, 2019 and the internal order of the Director, S. Yesembayeva. from 10.01.2019 "On the conduct of institutional accreditation." In January 2019, General Director of the ECA Sarsenbayeva S.S., training for self-assessment organization staff was conducted.

3. Analysis of institutional accreditation for compliance with standards for the external evaluation of International Centre for Medical Education "Yes !!!" and review of the strengths of each standard

Standard 1: Mission and outcomes

The Center is a receiver of the ECAS in terms of goals and objectives in the field of improving dental education and operates in independent legal status for 8 months (September 2018-April 2019). It directs its activity to ensure continuous professional development and protection of the rights of medical workers. The Center has developed and implemented a mission, vision and values. The main activity of the "Center" is to provide additional education for medical workers, training experts in the field of dental work, in matters of dental health, and the well-being of the population.

The EEC members obtained evidence of the mission, the involvement in its development of all staff members (members of the Academic Committee) and representatives of practical health care. The experts analyzed the Strategic Development Plan until 2022, which is based on the mission and developed in accordance with the main program documents in the field of health and education of the Republic of

Kazakhstan. At the same time, broader information about the mission of other stakeholders (employers, domestic and international partners) is required. All educational activities of the "Center" are aimed at achieving students' learning outcomes and thereby influencing the improvement of the quality of dental care to the population of the country.

Strengths Standard 1 on the basis of an external visit:

1. The uniqueness of further training of dentists project.
2. Location of "Center" in Almaty and enrollment of students major leading medical cities and regions of the country organizations.
3. Stable reputation as the " Center" among students and employers at the national and international levels.
4. Orientation of educational programs "Center" on the learning outcomes.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: correspond to - 12 correspond partilly -1 do not correspond - 0.

Standard 1: Completed

Recommendations:

- 1) Actively inform listeners about the expected learning outcomes in the programs of additional education.
- 2) To develop the Center's web site with relevant content.

Standard 2: Educational programmes

"Center" implemented virtually all forms of further education. Programs are mainly based on the requests and needs as health care organizations, and students. "Center" is assisting in the selection and the selection of topics for the improvement and uses different techniques and methods in teaching. To strengthen the partnership "Center" carries out international cooperation with leading hospitals and universities. A memorandum on cooperation in continuing medical education and exchange of experience have signed. In the accredited organization uses a variety of techniques in teaching (active, interactive, presentational, expert analysis of situations, analysis of real medical cases, and others.). All training programs are backed by appropriate teaching materials. At the same time, in the "Center" is not available unification of teaching methods and reporting documentation. Basically guided Policy Letter 9 does not reflect the modern requirements for conducting training documentation. Not implemented electronic document, which would streamline the planning, recording, logging (fixing), accounting and reporting. In working curriculum not clearly spelled out how to assess the knowledge and skills acquired during the training audience.

Strengths Standard 2 on the basis of an external visit:

1. Availability of current policy on the development and implementation of educational programs in the "Center" with domestic and foreign experts in the field of dentistry.
2. Widening the range of educational services and a contingent of listeners by bringing the employers involved in the process of improving the dental health of the population.
3. Orientation of educational programs of the Center to the needs of students,

starting from the university level.

4. Active use of innovative teaching methods, including webinars, team and problem teaching methods.

5. High level of satisfaction of listeners with the quality and content of advanced training programs.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: correspond to - 17 correspond to part - 2 do not correspond - 0.

Standard 2: Completed

Recommendations:

1) To unify all forms of educational-methodical documentation materials with the subsequent approval to the Academic Committee.

2) Greater use of web-site opportunities to inform potential students about programs of additional education.

3) More extensive use of interactive teaching methods in organizing short-term training programs, reducing the share of the lecture format.

Standard 3: Assessment and Documentation

With an external visit, experts obtained evidence of the use of innovative teaching, learning and assessment methods. So, at the lessons in the "Center" one can follow the students' presentation logic, the ability to use knowledge to explain various processes, prove their point of view, to refute the wrong opinion, etc. Various other methods of competency assessment are actively used: control of the initial level of knowledge, final control in the form of testing, demonstration of practical skills. The solution of situational problems, the compilation of an action algorithm for a given situation are widely used. Forms of classes are traditional, in the form of lectures with an illustrated presentation. Before the beginning of the class, an introductory survey of students is conducted to determine the level of training. However, analysis of the survey results and its discussion is not conducted. Valuation techniques based primarily on project specification recommendations at the same time, experts have not been demonstrated approaches to the assessment of students enrolled in short-term cycles of training. In general, no conclusive data on how the estimated quality of each training program, regardless of its duration. at the same time, experts do not approach to the assessment of students were shown the students on short-term cycles of training. In general, no conclusive data on how the estimated quality of each training program, regardless of its duration. at the same time, experts do not approach to the assessment of students were shown the students on short-term cycles of training. In general, no conclusive data on how the estimated quality of each training program, regardless of its duration.

Strengths Standard 3 on the basis of an external visit:

1. Educational activities of the "Center" allows you to monitor the level of survival knowledge among students, which allows to make a decision on additional training cycles.

2. Involvement of academic staff in the field of dentistry and health professionals in the planning, organization, development, implementation, evaluation and monitoring of educational programs.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: correspond - 6 correspond partly - 1 do not correspond - 0.

Standard 3: Completed

Recommendations:

- 1) To certify teachers by active teaching methods (TBL, PBL, CBL).
- 2) To supplement the portfolio of thematic cycles with handouts (videos, presentations, etc.) and create an electronic database as evidence of the uniqueness of the center's activities in the field of continuing education in dentistry.
- 3) To reinforce feedback with students and representatives of practical public health to improve training programs.
- 4) To introduce the practice of internal audit of the quality of education for finding problems and solving ways.

Standard 4: The Health professionals (Individual professional development)

"Center" ensures the provision of qualified training on cycles of training and retraining, and encourages students to participate in programs and activities of the NDP. Students are motivated by the accredited organization and realize that their self-education is a prerequisite for providing quality dental care to the population. "Center" developstraining programs that meet the requirements for training health professionals and are based on expert evaluation of data.

The "Center" aims to ensure that advanced training programs are based on educational strategies, taking into account the individual level of students' competence and work experience in the profession.

In the implementation of the educational process for the students are available classrooms equipped with audio-video equipment, flip chart, whiteboard, a set of phantoms, dental equipment and consumables needed to practice manual skills of students equipped with clinical sites, dental offices. Allocated time for independent work of students, have access to electronic information databases. Consultation, clinical analytical complex cases, practical exercises are conducted on the basis of the "Center" and dental clinics in Kazakhstan with practical skills and knowledge.

Strengths Standard 4 on the basis of an external visit:

1. Commitment to students and practical health care professionals for training in the "center".
2. Availability of additional education programs for the students, a diverse list to form a unique competences cycles.
3. Flexible policy of the Center in respect of the implementation of educational programs especially for students from the number of students of medical universities.

Conclusions of the EEC according to criteria correspond to - 19 correspond partly - 0 do not correspond - 0.

Standard 4: Completed

Recommendations:

- 1) To provide for the introduction of distance learning programs.

Standard 5: CPD PROVISION (Continuous Professional Development)

"Center" was established as an organization, providing training, retraining, advice to health professionals in the field of dental work in the choice of continuing professional development programs, both at home and abroad. assessment of students and recognition system CPD programs, as a necessary condition to improve competence listeners, which is the basic principles of the accredited organization, justified the passage of the institutional accreditation of the "Center".

The EEC has received evidence that the "Center" is the official legal organization, including dealing with the implementation of CPD programs in health care on the basis of the certificate of registration of IP No. KZ59TWQ00546161

It has been established that PC programs comply with the established requirements of the state (the Law on Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, orders on academic staff, etc.) to the quality of medical education. At the same time, teachers, despite their high professionalism, need advanced training in innovative methods and technologies of training and teaching. When studying contracts with teachers and external experts involved in training, it was discovered that the "Center" works closely with medical universities in Almaty and involves them in improving the quality of CPD programs..

Strengths Standard 5 on the basis of an external visit:

1. Qualified teaching staff of "Center" with more clinical, teaching, research, expertise.
2. Certified Coaches of "Center" who are members of various international associations.
3. Involvement of academic staff in the field of dentistry and health professionals in the planning, organization, development, implementation, evaluation and monitoring of educational programs.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: correspond to - 12 correspond partly - 1 do not correspond - 0.

Standard 5: completed

Recommendations:

- 1) To expand cooperation with medical educational organizations on the implementation of joint scientific and clinical research;
- 2) To improve the methodological support of training programs.

Standard 6: Educational resources

External experts in the course of implementation of the program visit the "Center" provide evidence of a sufficient number of study areas, classrooms (classrooms with a total area - 398.7 m², lecture hall, a total area of 47 m²) contracts with clinical sites (9). To implement further education programs relevant clinical base is determined. The rooms provide a safe environment for staff and students.

"Center" provides access to e-learning tools (links to international databases Pubmed, Scopus, Medline, DynaMed, Webofknowledge, Sochranelibrary, professional literature, electronic books). "Center" is an active information activity on social networks Facebook, Telegram, Instagram.

"Center" apply multidisciplinary approaches in education.

"Center" is a member of the United Kazakhstan Association of Dentists (EKAS), professional dental associations of Kazakhstan, CIS and Baltic countries, the European Union, dental community. PPP have certificates of participants in international conferences, congresses and seminars on the problems of dental science and medical education.

At the same time, not fully discovered the scientific activity of the accredited organization.

Strengths Standard 6 on the basis of an external visit:

1. Availability of material and technical basis, sufficient for high quality further education.

2. Availability of agreements with clinical databases.

3. Access to information digital library resources through a contract with the libraries of medical universities.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: correspond to - 24 correspond partly -0 not correspond - 0.

Standard 6: completed

Recommendations:

1) To continue to improve the teaching methods and material and technical base of the Center.

Standard 7: Evaluation of CPD Activities

The Center assesses the quality of ongoing additional education programs, based on the results of feedback from students and teachers. EEC studied the questionnaires and analytical reports. For example, a situational analysis of the external factors of the Center, a systematic survey of consumers of educational services and employees of the organization, constant monitoring of changes in the legislative and regulatory database, etc. The monitoring and analysis of data on the assessment of the CPD is carried out by AK Center. The work programs were drawn up in accordance with the Model Program for Advanced Training and Retraining of Medical and Pharmaceutical Personnel, approved by order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 165 dated April 14, 2017. The center permanently interacts with educational and health organizations, state bodies of management and control, international organizations, professional associations, which ensures the relevance of educational programs that correspond to modern trends in health development.

Strengths Standard 7 on the basis of an external visit:

1. Qualification and additional monitoring formation at listeners and stakeholder conducted on a continuous basis.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: correspond to - 10 correspond partly -1 do not correspond - 0.

Standard 7: Completed

Recommendations:

1) To involve employers in the process of monitoring and evaluation of educational programs.

2) To provide for the development of the Charter of the organization.

3) To implement a survey of employers to assess the quality of training of health professionals in the field of dental work.

4) According to the analysis of the survey of students to develop a plan to improve the activities of the "Center" and further education programs.

Standard 8: Organization

"Center" is engaged in different kinds of dental work, but the organization of additional professional education (training, retraining), defined by management as a key. In this regard, "the Center" initiated an institutional accreditation as a supplementary education. Organizational "Center" structure defined in accordance with the mission goals and tasks, processes the card.

The implementation of the educational process is ensured through training on stationary and on-site courses, including regional centers of RK, to meet the needs of professionals, students and employers, through the implementation of additional education programs, as well as the implementation of individual programs for continuous personal growth of the student or the healthcare professionals, in accordance with their needs and requirements.

The activities of the "Center" on the basis of the strategic plan of the organization. An important part of the plan is ensuring the necessary financial and material resources. The measures provided for in the strategic plan, aimed at improving the economic efficiency of the "Center". Center revenues generated by income from fee-based educational activities of training and retraining.

The expenditure part of the Center's budget is formed from salary payments, settlements with the budget for mandatory types of payments (pension, social tax, OSMI), maintenance costs of the "Center", rent, purchase of scientific and methodical literature, economic and other expenses.

From the analysis of financial results shows that the amount of financial resources allocated for the implementation of CPD programs is not sufficient to ensure an appropriate material and technical equipment, the development of information networks.

Strengths of Standard 8 on the basis of an external visit:

1. Appropriate management to ensure the quality of supplementary education programs.

2. Academic Leadership in additional education in dentistry.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: correspond - 8 correspond partly - 1 do not correspond - 0.

Standard 8: Completed

Recommendations:

1) To strengthen the methodological work of the center invited experienced in teaching methods in the field of medical education.

Standard 9: Continuous Renewal

"Center" is carried out constant monitoring of changes in health care in the field of dental practice and medical education, legal and regulatory documentation and

changes in society and in the light of these updates "Center" develops its activity. Held continuous improvement process, further education in accordance with the requirements of the health care system, the requirements and expectations of direct consumers, stakeholders; study, analysis and implementation of advanced, including foreign experience to improve the level of professional skills of specialists. Evaluating the effectiveness of "Center", results of operations carried out on the basis of audience satisfaction.

Strengths Standard 9 on the basis of an external visit:

1. Educational programs tailored to the practical needs of health care

EEC conclusions on the criteria: correspond to - 5 correspond partially - 0 do not correspond - 0.

Standard 9: Completed

No recommendations.

4. Recommendations for improving institutional performance International Centre for Medical Education "Yes !!! ":

1) Actively inform listeners about the expected learning outcomes in the programs of additional education.

2) To develop the Center's web site and use the opportunity to inform potential students about programs of additional education.

3) To improve the methodological support of training programs:

– To unify all forms of educational-methodical documentation materials with the subsequent approval to the Academic Committee;

– Strengthen the methodical work of "Center" inviting experienced methodologist in the field of medical education;

– To supplement the portfolio of thematic cycles with handouts (videos, presentations, etc.) and create an electronic database as evidence of the uniqueness of the center's activities in the field of continuing education in dentistry.

4) More extensive use of interactive teaching methods in organizing short-term training programs.

5) To certify teachers by active teaching methods (TBL, PBL, CBL).

6) To reinforce feedback:

– with students and representatives of practical public health to improve training programs;

– with employers to assess the quality of training of health professionals in the field of dental practice;

– based on analysis of the survey of students to develop a plan to improve the activities of the "Center" and further education programs.

7) To introduce the practice of internal audit of the quality of education with the involvement employers in the process of monitoring and evaluation of educational programs.

8) To expand cooperation with medical educational organizations on the implementation of joint scientific and clinical studies.

9) To provide for the introduction of distance learning programs.

5. EEC members came to unanimous opinion to recommend to the Accreditation Council to assign a status of Institutional Accreditation Organization, carrying out additional education **"International Centre for Medical Education" "Yes !!!"** for the period of 5 years.

Chairman of the External Expert Committee
Foreign expert

Vladimir Davydovitch Wagner

National academic expert

Khadzhieva Ayman Berikkalievna

Expert – representative
of the Healthcare Professionals

Spankulova Samal Manarbekovna

ECA observer

Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna

7. Рекомендация Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА

Члены ВЭК пришли к единогласному мнению рекомендовать Аккредитационному совету аккредитовать **International Centre for Medical Education "YES"** в качестве организации дополнительного образования сроком на 5 лет.

Председатель Внешней экспертной комиссии – зарубежный эксперт	Вагнер Владимир Давыдович	
Национальный академический эксперт	Хаджиева Айман Бериккалиевна	
Эксперт - представитель практического здравоохранения	Спанкулова Самал Манарбековна	
Эксперт – слушатель		
Наблюдатель ЕЦА	Умарова Макпал Альдибековна	

Quality profile and the criteria for external evaluation of the "International Centre for Medical Education "Yes !!! " for compliance with the Standards for Institutional Accreditation of Organisations for Continuing Professional Development (CPD) for healthcare professionals

Standard	Criteria for assessment	Assessment		
		Comply	Partially comply	Do not comply
1.	Mission and Outcomes	12	1	0
2.	Educational programme	17	2	0
3.	Assessment and Documentation	5	1	0
4.	The Healthcare Professionals (Individual professional development)	19	0	0
5.	CPD PROVISION (Continuous Professional Development)	12	1	0
6.	Educational resources	24	0	0
7.	Evaluation of CPD Activities	10	1	0
8.	Organization	8	1	0
9.	Continuous Renewal	5	0	0
Total		112	7	0